

Models of practice and training in psychotherapy: cross-national perspectives from Italy and Canada

Victoria Klimkowski, Sofia McRae, Alexia Blick, Laurence Beaulieu, J. Reese S. Handley, Anara A. Hopley, Caroline A. Hyde, Devika M. Jain, Sylvia Kolodziejczyk, Josiane Laliberté, Alexa Lévesque, Lara M. Masri, Anya M. Monet, Reagan S. Nedi, Rachel Valihrach, Giorgio A. Tasca

doi: 10.4081/ripppo.2024.732

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

Supplementary Table 1. Themes, codes, and data extracts from Canadian interviews

Themes	Codes	Code Descriptions	Data Extracts
Training in Canada	Appreciation for Theoretical Base	<i>Research and theory in the training of psychologists instills a strong theoretical and conceptual base that contributes to their success as practitioners.</i>	“A Ph.D. level clinical psychologist should know how to read a research paper and assess whether it makes sense whether it was done in a way that. You can take what the findings are as something sent there is something reasonable or plausible.”
	Appreciation for Practical Training	<i>Practical training enhances the development of the required skills to be a clinician.</i>	“...I got a lot of experience. And inpatient outpatient hospital and outpatient mental health, working with all different types of people ...”
	Importance of Supervision	<i>The one-on-one interaction between a supervisor and student is important to educational development.</i>	“One-on-one supervision for clinical cases, watching videos with your supervisor, going through transcripts or recordings of the sessions with your supervisor, having a safe place with your supervisor to talk about all your anxieties and doubts and fears. And stuff that comes up and countertransference that comes up while working with your patients in a really safe, non judgmental, supportive, we're all in this together atmosphere.”
	Impact of Supervisors	<i>Supervisors have a significant impact not only on the nature and quality of students' training, but also on the path that they take in their future careers.</i>	“I had that by luck and timing of when I did my PhD. I had really good professors and supervisors...I felt very ready to work with patients independently. I am but my opinion is that that's very particular to the time and place that I did my PhD and the supervisors that I had.”

Changes to Training	Professors Should be Practicing Therapists	<i>Professors who have clinical experience are better due to their knowledge of the realities of being a practitioner.</i>	“I think that the professors and faculty who are training need to be actual practitioners. I think it's a big problem if they are not practitioners because students are getting a disembodied science that's not actually connected to practice, and that is very unhelpful in my opinion. It's like it's detached from reality of practicing as a clinical psychologist.”
	More Focus on Human Psychology Instead of Diagnoses	<i>Psychology education needs to take a more humanistic approach rather than simply focusing on theories and concepts detached from real life.</i>	“The extent that students are being taught diagnosis and diagnostic classification systems and treatments for diagnosis. I really believe that clinical psychology students need to learn about human beings. [...] I really think it's unhelpful to teach diagnosis and how to treat a diagnosis. We treat humans.”
	Need for Greater Standardizing Training	<i>The nature of training methods, approaches, assessments, professors, and supervisors greatly fluctuates across schools and programs. Such inconsistency causes a variance in the quality of training students receive.</i>	“Like it shouldn't be left up to chance that a student has to make sure that they find what they need.”
	Need for More Practical Experience	<i>It is integral to include more practical experience within training so that students are better prepared for their future careers.</i>	“I think the clinical part is also important because that provides them [students] with an applied experience to be able to know how to provide therapy, some of the more experiential aspects of working in clinical psychology...”
	Narrowness of Training	<i>Training methods and curricula are limited in scope and fail to provide a diverse variety of knowledge to students.</i>	“I think if there was something that I would want to change is to see a much more varied approach to the training and preparation of clinical psychologists in various methodologies of psychotherapy”
Scientist-Practitioner Model	Importance of Understanding Research	<i>It is crucial for clinical practitioners to have the ability to read and produce new research and incorporate these into their practice.</i>	“I want them [students] to leave having had a research experience that helps them understand the importance of doing evidence-based research or evidence-based practice and knowing how to consult and read about the literature so that they're continually up to date on the best practices for providing services to clients. [...] The research teaches them [students] how to read about and how to understand science, and then the clinical side helps them to understand how to apply science in the context of psychology.”
	Appreciation for Research Experience	<i>Research experience integrated into training approaches greatly benefits students' development as psychology professionals.</i>	“I started volunteering in labs in my second year. I got to do some posters. I got to get involved in lots of different labs, did lots of research projects. Along with all the courses that I was taking. And I would say that that's probably what prepared me the most.”

	Model Provides Solid Foundation	<i>When the S-P Model is implemented into training, a fruitful foundation of psychology knowledge is instilled within students.</i>	“The research teaches them [students] how to read about and how to understand science, and then the clinical side helps them to understand how to apply science in the context of psychology”
	Lack of Integration Between Research and Practice	<i>Students are not necessarily taught how to combine their theoretical and research knowledge with their practical and clinical skills.</i>	“So, I'm wearing my scientist/researcher hat right now and then I'm in my clinical hat [later] and they don't really have that much to do with each other.”
Accessibility to Training	Training too Long. Not Graduating Enough Students	<i>The length of psychology education is far too long and contributes to the insufficient number of practitioners.</i>	“So, I would say that's ... one of the challenges that we face as a profession is ensuring that we're still able to move people through programs and graduate them in sufficient numbers to be able to meet the needs of society”
	Training is too Costly for Students	<i>The cost of psychology education is too high and limits the number of students graduating.</i>	“...the cost of the program should be lowered because more students would have the chance to become clinical psychologists. This would then lower the high demand for psychologists in Ontario.”
Accessibility to Treatment	Public Sector is Inaccessible	<i>The public sector has limited resources and funds to be able to meet all patients' needs.</i>	“Many patients need more than, say, 16 or 26 sessions, but that's all ... like there must be limits. In private practice, of course, there's no [limits] – a person is ... only limited by how much they can afford. So, I see people who can afford therapy in my private practice, but that means that I can see people for a decade if that's what they want to do.”
	Not Enough Psychologists	<i>There is a limited number of psychologists who are accessible to the public and able to provide care.</i>	“...the other driver of access to psychological services is the number of practitioners that are generally available- we don't have enough psychologists to meet the demands of the Canadian population and that is true in all jurisdictions with the exception perhaps, of Quebec. Quebec actually has half the total number of psychologists in Canada.”
	Private Sector Only Available to Those Who Can Afford It	<i>The private sector of treatment is costly and is not accessible to all areas of the population.</i>	“...not everyone can afford private practice fees or if they can, they might be limited to a certain number of sessions depending on their financial situation. Limited by how much money they make or insurances.”

Professional Identity	Feelings of Competence as a Scientist	<i>The training students receive in Canadian Clinical PhD programs allows them to feel competent as scientists and as practitioners.</i>	“... the fact that we bring that research mentality and a research knowledge base to the work that we do. Uh, it's a it's a unique contribution and a unique set of skills or expertise that many of the other health professions don't necessarily have to the same degree and so I think that gives us a particular role in position on multidisciplinary teams that puts us in good stead”
Political and Cultural Context	Consideration and Inclusion of Cultures	<i>Psychology training and practice needs to be mindful of the diverse characteristics of all cultures and minorities.</i>	“As trainees, we are now required to strive toward cultural competence, consider whether the instruments we use (both for assessment and treatment) are appropriate for diverse client populations, and reflect on the harmful biases we bring to the therapy room.”
	Eurocentric Point of View	<i>Historically, the psychology field has been dominated by western perspectives and traditions.</i>	“I think training and how psychotherapy in general looks in Canada is influenced by our political context of being attached both to the UK/Europe via the Commonwealth and our francophone roots in Quebec, as well as our proximity to the US”
	Slow Change in Values in the Field of Psychology	<i>Values associated with the field of psychology are slow to modernize.</i>	“The clinical psychology program at the University of Ottawa has recently changed its admission requirements to admit and train more psychologists of colour. These efforts are recent, and time will tell whether they prove to be effective. Much more work remains to be done.”

Supplementary Table 2. Themes, codes, and data extracts from Italian interviews.

Themes	Codes	Code Description	Data Extracts
Training in Italy	Importance of Supervisors on Training	<i>The approach and attention that a supervisor gives their student has a big impact on training and future career.</i>	“In my personal experience, I would have been lost as a clinical psychologist working with, at least, the more complex patients. So, I feel lucky to have an integrative supervisor.”
	Importance of Undergoing Therapy for Psychotherapy Students	<i>Personal therapy can help students to work on their personal development, which can allow them to better treat patients.</i>	“...like to keep the focus on the therapist and the therapist’s personal development. [...] You also apply the theory and then you’re also considering yourself”
Pros of the Training Model in Italy	Flexibility in Perspectives Offered in Private Psychotherapy Schools	<i>Different psychotherapy schools offer different programs and approaches which allows students to choose one tailored to them.</i>	“In private schools, students and trainees are able to have a choice in what they want to do, since different schools have different focuses.”
	Strong Theoretical Base Leads to Well Rounded Professionals	<i>Having all the theoretical knowledge needed before beginning their practical psychotherapy training gives students a strong base from which to build.</i>	“The students appreciate that the integrative model has a strong emphasis on research informing practice. He values integrating research into practice.”
Cons of the Training Model in Italy	University Professors Often are not Clinicians	<i>Professors need to have experience treating patients to teach students how to do so.</i>	“This very difficult to teach clinical psychology if you never have seen a patient because the students want to discuss, want to learn by clinical experience”
	Psychotherapy Schools are not Standardized	<i>Need for specific curriculum applied across psychotherapy schools and universities in order to ensure a complete and standardized education for all students.</i>	“Not all of them are focused on evidence-based treatments. Or focus on research-based assessments and interventions and that sort of thing. So some of the schools that he’s aware of, don’t do that and the trainees either don’t know or aren’t aware that that’s a missing part of their training.”

	Not Enough Practical Experience in Training	<i>Psychotherapy schools and universities need to give students more opportunities to treat real patients, watch recordings, watch others work and do simulations</i>	“I think it’s very important that some schools improve the practical experience of the students during training”
	Need to Better Understand Business Practices	<i>Students need to know how to run a private practice from the business side as well as knowing how to treat patients.</i>	“There are no lectures or courses in university that made them aware of or how to deal with the financial aspect of running a private practice.”
	Lack of Scientific Training and Evidence Based Practice in Psychotherapy Schools	<i>Psychotherapy schools should train students not only to treat patients, but to produce research and apply it to their practice.</i>	“One of the weaknesses in the training is that some of the psychotherapy schools, because of private entities, not all of them are focused on evidence-based treatments. Or focus on research-based assessments and interventions and that sort of thing. So, some of the schools ... don't do that and the trainees either don't know or aren't aware that that's a missing part of their training.”
	Separation of Theoretical and Clinical Components of Training in University	<i>Clinical and theoretical training should go hand-in-hand to allow students to integrate both into their practice.</i>	“But our students know that they will not end up and finished the university, I mean the master, with some knowledge about how to work with patients. They just know they will have a bunch of theoretical knowledge. Which may -they could use the work in other fields, related fields and not as psychotherapies.”
Scientist-Practitioner Model	Leads to Well Rounded Professionals	<i>The Scientist-Practitioner Model allows students to integrate clinical practice and research at once into their training and practice.</i>	“And also, I think that training as scientists is a good thing, because it opens your mind, I figured, more self-aware of newest research, researchers, and you are aware of the scientific process.”
	Model Allows for Research Competence	<i>Training practitioners as scientists produces better clinical researchers. Practitioners can apply new findings to their practice and researchers can study relevant clinical phenomena.</i>	“I think that would be great to train scientists. While a lot of my colleagues have not bare minimum understanding of how to read a scientific article and that would be limiting. I mean, other colleagues that practice psychotherapy, if they haven't received scientific training as during a PhD, they will not be able to produce evidence about it or communicate about it with the scientific community.”

	Applying the Model in Italy	<i>Thoughts of interviewees on applying the Scientist- Practitioner Model.</i>	<p>“...the model could work, depending on the yearly agreement with the clinical institutions”</p> <p>“I think it's a nice model, the one you have in North America. It trains better therapists, I think, simply because there are lower numbers of [students], so it's easier to supervise them. But, that's not something you will do here, because it will require you to change so many things on so many levels.”</p>
Accessibility to Training	Training is Expensive	<i>Psychotherapy training is very expensive for students.</i>	“...the problem of the private universities which have a super high fees.”
	Many Places Available in Psychotherapy School	<i>Psychotherapy schools in Italy have many seats available for students. This means they produce many graduate psychotherapists.</i>	“Consider that our training program at [psychotherapy school] I think it trains maybe 100 people per year, which is a very big number. Consider that our school is just one of the 70 we have just in Lombardy. So maybe the number of private schools in Italy, it's above 250.”
	Difficulty Finding Internships	<i>Given the large number of master's students in psychology, it is difficult to secure an internship.</i>	“Consider that our training program at the psychotherapy school, I think it trains maybe 100 people per year, which is a very big number.... So, consider how complicated it is sometimes to actually find a place where to do your internship.”
Accessibility to Treatment	Private Psychotherapy Reserved for Medium-high Income Populations	<i>Psychotherapy treatment in the private sector is a luxury only medium-high income Italian patients can afford.</i>	“Psychotherapy sessions are high level luxury.”
	Limited Government Funds for Lower Income Patients	<i>Limited government funds for public psychotherapy clinics. This means that therapists in the public system are not paid well, and not incentivised to work there. This impacts patient care for low-income patients.</i>	<p>“So that means that also the professionals are less motivated to do that in this way and they're paid less.”</p> <p>“From the other, the political situation [that] doesn't help citizens to be accompanied in their healthcare pathway.”</p>
Professional Identity	Practical Experience Helps Determine Identity	<i>Practical experience impacts a psychotherapist's identity and practice.</i>	“70% my internship, 30% my training courses.”

	Training Approach Impacts Identity	<i>Approaches learned during training impact a psychotherapist's identity and practice.</i>	“The identity of it changes based on which school one attends. Again, because different schools provide different training some are totally oriented on CBT approaches, some might be oriented on psychodynamic ones. So, the way I see him or herself is also based on the specific training program or school of psychotherapy they have attended.”
Political, Economic, and Cultural Context	Legitimacy of the Profession	<i>In Italy, the profession of psychotherapy is becoming more recognized by insurance companies. This has not always been the case.</i>	“[Insurance companies] don't always recognize psychotherapy done by psychologists, but sometimes, only if done by physicians.”
	Competition Among Practitioners for Patients	<i>Practitioners feel that there are too many psychotherapists for the number of patients who need them and who are able to pay for services.</i>	“Psychotherapists in Italy feel that there are not enough patients available because there are so many psychotherapists in Italy....not many of us have many patients after the degree since there are so many psychologists in Italy, so it's not easy to retrieve [find] patients.You have to be good enough to be known and to also be competitive with other psychotherapists,”
	Stigma Around Receiving Treatment	<i>In Italy, there is stigma around psychotherapy treatment in practice because of historical and cultural context.</i>	“There was still the idea of psychologists as ‘doctor of the fools’. And that was not good since healthcare services didn't have a compulsory psychologist inside. Not even some prisons, not even the hospitals, which is absurd if we think about that.”

Supplementary Table 3. Interview protocol example (Canada): interview of a practicing psychologist.

Objectives

- To document the psychologist's educational and work background – how they came to be practicing clinical psychology. Is this a common path for a clinical psychologist?
- To describe the psychologist's views of training in clinical psychology – pros, cons, how it affects their practice, their identity as a psychologist, the Scientist-Practitioner Model, and professional identity.
- To describe the psychologist's experience of providing psychotherapy.
- To document any changes the psychologist might suggest for current training and practice models in clinical psychology – what would they maintain, what would they change?

Interview**Introduction**

- Interviewers introduce themselves and why they are doing this interview.
 - Describe the interviewer's goals for this interview? (To get a practicing clinical psychologist's perspective on practice and training in clinical psychology, to compare training and practice in Canada to Italy).
- Request consent to video record the interview. Inform the interviewee that interview will be about 30 - 45 minutes long.

Introductory Questions

- "What is your name and what is your role in providing mental health care?"
- "Describe your previous educational and training experiences and how they prepared you for your current role in providing psychotherapy."
- "What is the nature of your clinical practice? How much time do you spend in each location, what services do you provide?"
- "What is a common work week for you? – what activities do you engage in on a weekly basis?"

Interview Content

- "How are you reimbursed for your work in each practice setting?"
- "How do these models of reimbursement affect your practice and the care patients receive?"
- "As you consider the training that you received as a clinical psychologist, how do you feel that it prepared you for your career?"
- "Which aspects of your training, if any, did not adequately prepare you for your career?"
- "Most clinical training programs in Canada espouse the Scientist-Practitioner Model of training and practice. What are your impressions of this model?"
- "What aspects of clinical psychology training would you keep? What aspects would you change?"

Interview Conclusion

- "Is there anything about you're training or your practice that you would like to convey to us that you haven't had a chance to say?"
 - "Any other questions for us about our project?"
 - "Thank you for your time and for volunteering for this interview."
-